## **EXHIBIT G**

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT, SEVENTH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT, IN AND FOR VOLUSIA COUNTY, FLORIDA

ELIZABETH WAY and STUART M. WAY,

Plaintiffs,

v. CASE NO.: 2011-10945-CIDL

GEORGE T. BESONG, M.D.; GEORGE
T. BESONG, M.D., OB/GYN, LLC d/b/a
WOMEN'S HEALTH RESOURCE
CENTER; and SOUTHWEST VOLUSIA
HEALTHCARE CORPORATION d/b/a
FLORIDA HOSPITAL FISH MEMORIAL,
and C.R. BARD, INC.,

Defendants.

Videotaped Deposition of

RALPH ZIPPER, M.D.

Saturday, August 29, 2015

10:26 a.m.

Zipper Urogynecology Associates

200 South Harbor City Boulevard, Suite 401

Melbourne, FL 32901

Georgeanne Rodriguez, RPR

Way vs. Besong

Ralph Zipper, M.D.

8/29/2015

	Page 38		Page 40
1	THE WITNESS: To the best of my recollection,	1	in my general opinion of the Avaulta because they
2	that is a correct statement. I do believe that you	2	involve a Marlex mesh product of high density. And
3	will find opinions on the Align product in my notes	3	the severe inflammation, contraction, degradation,
4	which you received today, Exhibit Number 2.	4	and associated pain of those products are well
5	BY MR. BOWDEN:	5	described in my general report.
6	Q. Okay. Okay. I'm just trying to figure out	6	Now, I can go over those. I can go over the
7	the best way to go about this, Doctor. Do you want	7	overwhelming breadth of medical literature that
8	let's do it like this:	8	quite consistently demonstrates the material
9	Can you tell me your opinion regarding what	9	mismatch associated with polypropylene mesh; the
10	you call the negligent and defective design of the Align	10	concerns of heavier polypropylene meshes compared
11	product that's implanted in Mrs. Way on November 21st,	11	to the lightweight polypropylene meshes, the
12	2008?	12	concerns over pore size; concerns over the methods
13	MR. THORNBURGH: Objection.	13	that it transgress and transit the obturator
14	THE WITNESS: My	14	foramen in proximity to the obturator canal; the
15	MR. THORNBURGH: You just want him to go off?	15	anatomic concerns as they pertain to instructions
16	You just want him to explain all of his opinions?	16	for use which were inadequate by both a
17	MR. BOWDEN: Yes.	17	conscientious physician's standpoint and I would
18	Well, no, his opinion regarding he says the	18	suggest also from the regulations, requirements,
19	first opinion is the	19	and recommendations of the FDA as it pertains to
20	THE WITNESS: Okay. Here, I'm going to help	20	both premarket notification applications and also
21	everybody here, because, I mean, I understand	21	as well as labeling requirements both dating back
22	MR. BOWDEN: Sure. And I just got this report	22	to the late 1980s through the early 2000s,
23	this morning so I haven't read it yet.	23	including the mesh-specific recommendations and
23 24		24	
	THE WITNESS: It was our intent to get that to	24 25	regulations.
25	you yesterday	23	So what I would suggest for the most part is
	Page 39		Page 41
1	MR. BOWDEN: I understand that.	1	that we consider all of my opinions in the general
2	THE WITNESS: but there were factors.	2	opinion as it relates to the Avaulta product that
3	I think Mr. Thornburgh's concern is you have	3	relate to polypropylene mesh, pore size, the
4	asked for what could be construed as a general	4	material defects of polypropylene mesh, and all
5	opinion. There's a lot of information that goes	5	those defects that involve transgressing the
6	behind determining the material and I have an	6	obturator foramen and the arms of the mesh to be my
7	opinion on the material defects and the	7	opinions with regard to the material defects and at
8	methodological defects.	8	least a portion of the methodological defects of
9	I will start off by saying that the material	9	the Align.
10	defects are well characterized in my general	10	BY MR. BOWDEN:
11	opinion, which he have agreed not to talk about	11	Q. Okay. So
12	today unless there's	12	A. And I can begin to describe those, but we will
13	BY MR. BOWDEN:	13	be going over, probably at length, many of the opinions
14	Q. Well, the Align general opinion you can't talk	14	that appear in the Avaulta.
15	about.	15	Q. And I'm not trying to do that, Doctor, because
		16	I know that time and efficiency
16 17	MR. THORNBURGH: That was the question.	17	THE WITNESS: Georgia, I'm sorry. Are you
17	THE WITNESS: Please, let me finish.		
18	Gentlemen, we talked about this earlier, we're	18	okay?
19	all going to let	19	THE REPORTER: Yeah.
	MR. BOWDEN: You're right, Doctor, you're	20	THE WITNESS: All right.
20			BY MR. BOWDEN:
20 21	right.	21	0 11 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1
20 21 22	right.  THE WITNESS: And I'll do it to you a few	22	Q. I know that I know that time and efficiency
20 21 22 23	right.  THE WITNESS: And I'll do it to you a few times too, so it happens.	22 23	is a concern for everybody, the court, Mr. Thornburgh,
20 21 22 23 24 25	right.  THE WITNESS: And I'll do it to you a few	22	

Way vs. Besong

Ralph Zipper, M.D.

8/29/2015

	Page 306		Page 308
1	I have explanted on other patients, I cannot I have	1	properties of the mesh since the time of initial
2	not I have not looked at or touched Mrs. Way's mesh	2	implantation to a more brittle, fragile, less elastic
3	explants.	3	state.
4	Q. I'm sorry. Could you today analyze the	4	Q. Doctor, just for the sake of formality, and I
5	explanted mesh from Mrs. Way's various explants and	5	don't have to go into depth, this is your CV,
6	trimmings to determine if it is degraded at all?	6	Exhibit 18, that was attached to your expert disclosure
7	MR. THORNBURGH: Objection. We've got other	7	in this case.
8	experts.	8	(Exhibit 18 marked for identification.)
9	MR. BOWDEN: Oh, Iakovlev?	9	BY MR. BOWDEN:
10	MR. THORNBURGH: Yeah.	10	Q. I'll give you one with the pretty purple
11	MR. BOWDEN: Okay. Good enough.	11	staple that I borrowed from your receptionist outside.
12	BY MR. BOWDEN:	12	A. Oh, cool.
13	Q. I'm assuming that your opinions do not overlap	13	Q. Doctor, I just wanted to establish whether
		14	-
14	with Dr. Iakovlev's opinions, Doctor?		this is up to date as of the date today that you're
15	MR. THORNBURGH: Objection.	15	sitting here. I sorry, I put that
16	MR. BOWDEN: Well, is it fair to state,	16	A. It's okay.
17	Counsel, that he's not going to be testify to	17	Q exhibit sticker over Mount Sinai.
18	degradation of mesh?	18	A. That's all right.
19	MR. THORNBURGH: He's not going to well, I	19	Q. No disrespect intended.
20	think there's a difference, so if you want to know	20	A. Yeah, I mean, it's up to date with the
21	what I think, I'll tell you.	21	exception of the fact that I have an additional C-level
22	MR. BOWDEN: He's not going to testify to	22	consultation contract going on or I should say that
23	degradation of Mrs. Way's mesh; is that correct?	23	I'm performing C-level consultation work for a company
24	MR. THORNBURGH: Well, Dr. Iakovlev is going	24	that I cannot name at this point, a publicly traded
25	to testify about the degradation of Mrs. Way's	25	company, which includes labeling advice and regulatory
	Page 307		Page 309
1	mesh.	1	advice.
2	MR. BOWDEN: Right.	2	Q. What is and, I'm sorry, what does the term
3	THE WITNESS: My general opinion.	3	C level mean? Is that the letter C?
4	MR. BOWDEN: His general opinion has already	4	A. CEO.
5	been covered, I know.	5	Q. Oh, CEO. CEO level. I'm sorry.
6	MR. THORNBURGH: His general opinion has	6	A. Oh, no, I said C. I mean, it's an
7	already been covered, but the question may be	7	abbreviation.
8	and I don't know. The question may be does he have	8	Q. Okay.
9	any opinions based on Dr. Iakovlev's analysis and	9	A. CEO, COO, CFO.
10	findings of the explanted degraded mesh.	10	Q. Oh, C-level, got you, so chief officers in
11	THE WITNESS: Or the findings and descriptions	11	some in format, CFO, something like that.
12	of the general pathologist.	12	A. Something like that.
			0
13	MR. THORNBURGH: Right. BY MR. BOWDEN:	13	(Exhibit 19 marked for identification.)
14		14	BY MR. BOWDEN:
15	Q. Do you?	15	Q. Well, I've learned more than one new thing
16	A. Yes.	16	today, but that's the most recent new thing I've learned
17	Q. Are they in your report?	17	today.
18	A. No.	18	Doctor, this is, just for the sake of
		19	thoroughness, the amended complaint in this matter.
19	Q. What are they?		
19 20	A. I agree with Dr. Iakovlev's findings and the	20	Have you seen this document before?
19 20 21	A. I agree with Dr. Iakovlev's findings and the fragmented nature of the explants, especially the	20 21	A. Yes, I have.
19 20 21 22	A. I agree with Dr. Iakovlev's findings and the fragmented nature of the explants, especially the explants of Dr. Thompson, are consistent with my	20 21 22	<ul><li>A. Yes, I have.</li><li>Q. Do you know when the first time you saw that</li></ul>
19 20 21 22 23	A. I agree with Dr. Iakovlev's findings and the fragmented nature of the explants, especially the explants of Dr. Thompson, are consistent with my findings on multiple explantation surgeries where the	20 21 22 23	<ul><li>A. Yes, I have.</li><li>Q. Do you know when the first time you saw that document was?</li></ul>
19 20 21 22	A. I agree with Dr. Iakovlev's findings and the fragmented nature of the explants, especially the explants of Dr. Thompson, are consistent with my	20 21 22	<ul><li>A. Yes, I have.</li><li>Q. Do you know when the first time you saw that</li></ul>